

THE PRESENCE OF PFAS IN WASTES AND RELATED IMPLICATIONS ON THE CURRENT AND PROPOSED EUROPEAN REGULATORY FRAMEWORK: A SYSTEMATIC CRITICAL REVIEW

Alberto Pivato ¹, Giovanni Beggio ^{1,*}, Stefano Maggi ², Francesco Marrone ², Tiziano Bonato ³, Federico Peres ⁴, Wei Peng ^{5,6,7}, Maria Cristina Lavagnolo ¹

¹ Department of Civil, Environmental and Architectural Engineering, University of Padova, Via Marzolo 9, 35131, Padova, Italy

² LabAnalysis Srl, Via Europa, 5 - 27041 Casanova Lonati (PV), Italy

³ Department of Environmental Sciences, Informatics and Statistics, Ca' Foscari University of Venice, Venice, Italy

⁴ Butti and Partners, Palazzo Pindemonte, Via Leoni 4, 37121 Verona, Italy

⁵ Institute of Waste Treatment and Reclamation, Tongji University, Shanghai, 200092, PR China

⁶ Shanghai Institute of Pollution Control and Ecological Security, Shanghai, 200092, PR China

⁷ Shanghai Engineering Research Center of Multi-source Solid Wastes Co-processing and Energy Utilization, Shanghai, 200092, PR China

* Corresponding author: Giovanni Beggio, giovanni.beggio@unipd.it

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

List of documents included in Supplementary Documents

S1. Documents considered eligible for the data extraction

Table S1. Collection of regulation limits or proposal of limits on PFASs which have or may have impacts on waste management.

Table S.2. Descriptive statistics of the concentration data gathered for the category "Paper and cardboard waste".

Table S.3. Descriptive statistics of the concentration data gathered for the category "Textile and leather waste".

Table S.4. Descriptive statistics of the concentration data gathered for the category "Plastic waste".

Table S.5. Descriptive statistics of the concentration data gathered for the category "Metal waste and metal scraps".

S1. Documents considered eligible for the data extraction

- 1. Bečanová, J., Melymuk, L., Vojta, Š., Komprdová, K., & Klánová, J. (2016). Screening for perfluoroalkyl acids in consumer products, building materials and wastes. Chemosphere, 164, 322–329. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2016.08.112
- Chibwe, L., De Silva, A. O., Spencer, C., Teixera, C. F., Williamson, M., Wang, X., & Muir, D. C. G. (2023). Target and Nontarget Screening of Organic Chemicals and Metals in Recycled Plastic Materials. Environmental Science & Technology, 57(8), 3380–3390. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.2c07254
- Chinthakindi, S., Zhu, H., & Kannan, K. (2021). An exploratory analysis of poly- and per-fluoroalkyl substances in pet food packaging from the United States. Environmental Technology and Innovation, 21, 101247. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eti.2020.101247Chibwe, L., De Silva, A. O., Spencer, C., Teixera, C. F., Williamson, M., Wang, X., & Muir, D. C. G. (2023). Target and Nontarget Screening of Organic Chemicals and Metals in Recycled Plastic Materials. Environmental Science & Technology, 57(8), 3380–3390. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.2c07254
- D'eon, J. C., Crozier, P. W., Furdui, V. I., Reiner, E. J., Libelo, E. L., & Mabury, S. A. (2009). Observation of a Commercial Fluorinated Material, the Polyfluoroalkyl Phosphoric Acid Diesters, in Human Sera, Wastewater Treatment Plant Sludge, and Paper Fibers. Environ. Sci. Technol., 43(12), 4589–4594. https://doi.org/10.1021/es900100d
- Dolman, S., & Pelzing, M. (2011). An optimized method for the determination of perfluorooctanoic acid, perfluorooctane sulfonate and other perfluorochemicals in different matrices using liquid chromatography/ion-trap mass spectrometry. Journal of Chromatography B, 879(22), 2043–2050. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jchromb.2011.05.032
- 6. Drage, D.S.; Sharkey, M.; Berresheim, H.; Coggins, M.; Harrad, S. Rapid Determination of Selected PFAS in Textiles Entering the Waste Stream. Toxics 2023, 11, 55. https://doi.org/10.3390/toxics11010055
- Elizalde, M. P., Gómez-Lavín, S., & Urtiaga, A. (2018). Migration of perfluorinated compounds from paperbag to Tenax® and lyophilised milk at different temperatures. International Journal of Environmental Analytical Chemistry, 98(15), 1423–1433. https://doi.org/10.1080/03067319.2018.1562062
- ELV Environmental Services CLG, ELVES, 2016. Analysis of Automotive Shredder Residue from the Composition, Recycling and Recovery Trial for End of Life Vehicles in the Republic of Ireland. Mayer Environmental, Middlesex, UK. http://chm.pops. int/Portals/0/download.aspx?d=UNEP-POPS-POPRC11FU-SUBM-decaBDE-Irela nd-20160301.En.pdf.
- Kim, M., Li, L. Y., Grace, J. R., Benskin, J. P., & Ikonomou, M. G. (2015). Compositional Effects on Leaching of Stain-Guarded (Perfluoroalkyl and Polyfluoroalkyl Substance-Treated) Carpet in Landfill Leachate. Environmental Science & Technology, 49(11), 6564–6573. https://doi.org/10.1021/es505333y
- Kotthoff, M., Müller, J. K., Jürling, H., Schlummer, M., & Fiedler, D. (2015). Perfluoroalkyl and polyfluoroalkyl substances in consumer products. Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 22(19), 14546–14559. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-015-4202-7
- 11. Liu, X., Guo, Z., Folk, E. E., & Roache, N. F. (2015). Determination of fluorotelomer alcohols in

selected consumer products and preliminary investigation of their fate in the indoor environment. Chemosphere, 129, 81–86. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2014.06.012

- 12. Martinez-Moral, M., & Tena, M. T. (2012). Determination of perfluorocompounds in popcorn packaging by pressurised liquid extraction and ultra-performance liquid chromatography-tandem mass spectrometry. Talanta, 101, 104–109. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.talanta.2012.09.007
- 13. Moreta, C., & Tena, M. T. (2013). Fast determination of perfluorocompounds in packaging by focused ultrasound solid–liquid extraction and liquid chromatography coupled to quadrupole-time of flight mass spectrometry. Journal of Chromatography A, 1302, 88–94. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chroma.2013.06.024
- Norwegian Environmental Agency, NEA, 2021. Environmental pollutants in post- consumer plastics. https://www.miljodirektoratet.no/sharepoint/downloaditem?id =01FM3LD2RGJ3TG4CATRFEKDGYMULDQ27X7.
- Poothong, S., Boontanon, S. K., & Boontanon, N. (2012). Determination of perfluorooctane sulfonate and perfluorooctanoic acid in food packaging using liquid chromatography coupled with tandem mass spectrometry. Journal of Hazardous Materials, 205–206, 139–143. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2011.12.050
- Rigby, H., Dowding, A., Fernandes, A., Humphries, D. J., Jones, N. R., Lake, I. R., Petch, R. G., Reynolds, C. S., Rose, M., & Smith, S. M. (2021). Concentrations of organic contaminants in industrial and municipal bioresources recycled in agriculture in the UK. Science of the Total Environment, 765, 142787. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.142787
- Rodgers, K. M., Swartz, C. L., Occhialini, J., Bassignani, P., McCurdy, M., & Schaider, L. A. (2022). How Well Do Product Labels Indicate the Presence of PFAS in Consumer Items Used by Children and Adolescents? Environmental Science & Technology, 56(10), 6294–6304. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.1c05175
- Schwartz-Narbonne, H., Xia, C., Shalin, A., Whitehead, H.D., Yang, D., Peaslee, G.F., Wang, Z., Wu, Y., Peng, H., Blum, A., Venier, M., Diamond, M.L., 2023. Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances in Canadian Fast Food Packaging. Environ. Sci. Technol. Lett. 10, 343–349. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.estlett.2c00926
- 19. Shoeib, T., Hassan, Y., Rauert, C., & Harner, T. (2016). Poly- and perfluoroalkyl substances (PFASs) in indoor dust and food packaging materials in Egypt: Trends in developed and developing countries. Chemosphere, 144, 1573–1581. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2015.08.066
- 20. Timshina, A., Aristizabal-Henao, J. J., Da Silva, B. F., & Bowden, J. A. (2021). The last straw: Characterization of per- and polyfluoroalkyl substances in commercially-available plant-based drinking straws. Chemosphere, 277, 130238. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2021.130238
- 21. Xu, Y., Noonan, G. O., & Begley, T. H. (2013). Migration of perfluoroalkyl acids from food packaging to food simulants. Food Additives & Contaminants: Part A, 30(5), 899–908. https://doi.org/10.1080/19440049.2013.789556
- 22. Yuan, G., Peng, H., Huang, C., & Hu, J. (2016). Ubiquitous Occurrence of Fluorotelomer Alcohols in Eco-Friendly Paper-Made Food-Contact Materials and Their Implication for Human Exposure. Environmental Science & Technology, 50(2), 942–950. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.5b03806

- 23. Zabaleta, I., Bizkarguenaga, E., Bilbao, D., Etxebarria, N., Prieto, A. F., & Zuloaga, O. (2016). Fast and simple determination of perfluorinated compounds and their potential precursors in different packaging materials. Talanta, 152, 353–363. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.talanta.2016.02.022
- Zabaleta, I., Blanco-Zubiaguirre, L., Baharli, E. N., Olivares, M., Prieto, A., Zuloaga, O., & Elizalde, M. P. (2020). Occurrence of per- and polyfluorinated compounds in paper and board packaging materials and migration to food simulants and foodstuffs. Food Chemistry, 321, 126746. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2020.126746
- 25. Zafeiraki, E., Costopoulou, D., Vassiliadou, I., Bakeas, E., & Leondiadis, L. (2014). Determination of perfluorinated compounds (PFCs) in various foodstuff packaging materials used in the Greek market. Chemosphere, 94, 169–176. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.09.092



Table S1. Collection of regulation limits or proposal of limits on PFASs which have or may have impacts on waste management.

Chemicals	Limits	State of the regulation	Implications in the waste management field	Reference
Perfluorooctane sulfonic acid and its derivatives (PFOS) C ₈ F ₁₇ SO ₂ X (X = OH, Metal salt (O-M+), halide, amide, and other derivatives including polymers) For more information on the list of substances see the work of Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Persistent, UK (2015)	 ANNEX IV. List of substances subject to waste management provisions set out in Article 7 ≤ 50 mg/kg (0.005 % by weight). ANNEX V. Disposal and recovery under Article 7(2) ≤ 50 mg/kg (0.005 % by weight). 	Existing limits □ Proposed limits	 disposal or recovery operations that may lead to recovery, recycling, reclamation or re-use of wastes classification of waste (potential) control and traceability following hazardous waste requirements 	Regulation (EU) 2019/1021 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 June 2019 on Persistent Organic Pollutants and amendments. ANNEX IV. List of substances subject to waste management provisions set out in Article 7 ANNEX V. Disposal and recovery under Article 7(2)
Perfluorooctanoic acid (PFOA), its salts and PFOA-related compounds For more information on the list of substances including salts and related compounds see UNEP, 2022 and OECD. 2018	 ANNEX IV. List of substances subject to waste management provisions set out in Article 7 ≤1 mg/kg for PFOA and its salts, ≤40 mg/kg for the sum of PFOA-related compounds ANNEX V. Disposal and recovery under Article 7(2) ≤50 mg/kg for PFOA and its salts ≤2000 mg/kg for PFOA-related compounds; 	Existing limits □ Proposed limits	 disposal or recovery operations that may lead to recovery, recycling, reclamation or re-use of wastes classification of waste (potential) control and traceability following hazardous waste requirements 	Regulation (EU) 2019/1021 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 June 2019 on Persistent Organic Pollutants and amendments. ANNEX IV. List of substances subject to waste management provisions set out in Article 7 ANNEX V. Disposal and recovery under Article 7(2)
Perfluorohexane sulfonic acid (PFHxS), its salts and PFHxS-related compounds For more information on the list of substances including salts and related compounds see UNEP, 2019 and OECD. 2018	ANNEX IV. List of substances subject to waste management provisions set out in Article 7 ≤1 mg/kg for PFHxS and its salts ≤40 mg/kg for the sum of PFHxS-related compounds ANNEX V. Disposal and recovery under Article 7(2) ≤50 mg/kg for PFHxS and its salts; ≤2000 mg/kg for PFHxS-related compounds	Existing limits □ Proposed limits	 disposal or recovery operations that may lead to recovery, recycling, reclamation or re-use of wastes classification of waste (potential) control and traceability following hazardous waste requirements 	Regulation (EU) 2019/1021 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 June 2019 on Persistent Organic Pollutants and amendments. ANNEX IV. List of substances subject to waste management provisions set out in Article 7 ANNEX V. Disposal and recovery under Article 7(2)

Chemicals	Limits	State of the regulation	Implications in the waste management field	Reference
Perfluorooctane sulfonic acid and its derivatives (PFOS) C ₈ F ₁₇ SO ₂ X (X = OH, Metal salt (O-M+), halide, amide, and other derivatives including polymers) For more information on the list of substances see the work of Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Persistent, UK (2015)	 Regulation (EU) 2019/1021. Annex I ≤ 10 mg/kg (0.001 % by weight) where PFOS are present in substances or in mixtures. ≤ 1000 mg/kg (0.1 % by weight) in semi-finished products or articles or parts thereof calculated with reference to the mass of structurally or microstructurally distinct parts that contain PFOS or, for textiles or other coated materials, if the amount of PFOS is lower than 1 μg/m² of the coated material. 	Existing limits □ Proposed limits	Procedure for end-of waste	POPs under the Stockholm Convention (decisions SC-4/17; SC-9/4) Annex "B". Restriction (UN Environment Programme and Stockholm Convention, 2023) Regulation (EU) 2019/1021 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 June 2019 on Persistent Organic Pollutants and amendments. ANNEX I. Part A. Substances listed in the Convention and in the Protocol as well as substances listed only in the Convention
Perfluorooctanoic acid (PFOA), its salts and PFOA-related compounds For more information on the list of substances including salts and related compounds see UNEP, 2022 and OECD. 2018	 Regulation (EU) 2019/1021. Annex I ≤ 0.025 mg/kg (0.0000025 % by weight) where PFOA or any of its salts are present in substances, mixtures or articles. ≤ 1 mg/kg (0.0001 % by weight) where any individual PFOA-related compound or a combination of PFOA-related compounds are present in substances, mixtures or articles. ≤ 20 mg/kg (0.002 % by weight) where PFOA- related compounds are present in a substance to be used as a transported isolated intermediate. ≤ 1 mg/kg (0.0001 % by weight) where PFOA and its salts are present in polytetrafluoroethylene (PTFE) micropowders produced by ionising irradiation or by thermal degradation as well as in mixtures and articles for industrial and professional uses containing PTFE micropowders until 18 August 2023. 	Existing limits □ Proposed limits	Procedure for end-of waste	POPs under the Stockholm Convention (decision SC-9/12). Annex "A". Elimination (UN Environment Programme and Stockholm Convention, 2023) Regulation (EU) 2019/1021 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 June 2019 on Persistent Organic Pollutants and amendments. ANNEX I. Part A. Substances listed in the Convention and in the Protocol as well as substances listed only in the Convention
 Perfluorohexane-1-sulphonic acid (PFHxS), its salts and related substances: Perfluorohexane sulfonic acids with the formula C₆F₁₃SO₃H, their salts and any combinations thereof; Any substance having a perfluoroalkyl group C₆F₁₃- directly attached to a sulfur atom. For more information on the list of substances including salts and related compounds see UNEP, 2019 and OECD. 2018 	 Proposed limits for the restriction of PFHxS, its salts and PFHxS-related substances when they are present in another substance, as a constituent, a mixture, an article or any parts thereof (Norwegian Environment Agency, 2019): ≤ 0.025 mg/kg (25 ppb) for the sum of PFHxS and its salts ≤ 1 mg/kg (1000 ppb) for the sum of PFHxS related substances. 	☐ Existing limits I Proposed limits	Procedure for end-of waste	POPs under the Stockholm Convention (decision SC-10/13). Annex "A". Elimination (UN Environment Programme and Stockholm Convention, 2023) This class of chemical is currently being assessed for a restriction under REACH (ECHA, 2023a)

DETRITUS - Multidisciplinary Journal for Circular Economy and Sustainable Management of Residues. © 2023 CISA Publisher. All rights reserved

Chemicals	Limits	State of the regulation	Implications in the waste management field	Reference
Perfluorocarboxylic Acids Containing 9 to 14 Carbon Atoms in the Chain (C9-C14 PFCAs), their Salts and C9-C14 PFCA- Related Substances For more information on the list of substances including salts and related compounds see ECHA, 2017.	 Limits for the restriction of Perfluorocarboxylic Acids Containing 9 to 14 Carbon Atoms in the Chain (C9-C14 PFCAs), their Salts and C9-C14 PFCA-Related Substances when they are present in another substance, as a constituent, a mixture, an article or any parts thereof: ≤ 0.025 mg/kg (25 ppb) for the sum of C9-C14 PFCAs and their salts ≤ 0.26 mg/kg (260 ppb) ppb for the sum of C9-C14 PFCA-related substances ≤ 10 mg/kg (10 ppm) for the sum of C9-C14 PFCAs, their salts and C9-C14 PFCA related substances, where they are present in a substance to be used as a transported isolated intermediate 	Existing limits □ Proposed limits	Procedure for end-of waste	Regulation (EU) 2021/1297 Amending Annex XVII to REACH as regards Perfluorocarboxylic Acids Containing 9 to 14 Carbon Atoms in the Chain (C9- C14 PFCAs), their Salts and C9-C14 PFCA-Related Substances. This law has become effective on February 25, 2023. Regulation (EC) 1907/2006 on Registration, Evaluation, Authorization and Restriction of Chemicals (REACH, consolidated version to July 2021) Annex XVII. Restrictions on the manufacture, placing on the market and use of certain dangerous substances, mixtures and articles. in 2021 Canada proposed to consider long-chain perfluorocarboxylic acids (C9-C21 PFCAs) for inclusion in the Stockholm Convention
Undecafluorohexanoic acid (PFHxA), its salts and related substances	 Proposed limits for the restriction of undecafluorohexanoic acid (PFHxA), its salts and related substances (BAuA et al., 2019) when they are present in another substance, as a constituent, a mixture, an article: ≤ 0.025 mg/kg (25 ppb) for for the sum of PFHxA and its salts ≤ 1 mg/kg (1000 ppb) for the sum of PFHxA- related substances. 	 □ Existing limits ☑ Proposed limits 	Procedure for end-of waste	This class of chemical is currently being assessed for a restriction under REACH (ECHA, 2023b)
Per- and polyfluoroalkyl substances (PFASs) defined as any substance that contains at least one fully fluorinated methyl (CF ₃ -) or methylene (-CF ₂ -) carbon atom (without any H/Cl/Br/l attached to it)	 Proposed limits for the restriction of PFASs (BAuA et al., 2023) when they are present in another substance, as a constituent, a mixture, an article: ≤ 0.025 mg/kg (25 ppb) for any PFAS as measured with targeted PFAS analysis (polymeric PFASs excluded from quantification) ≤ 0.25 mg/kg (250 ppb) for the sum of PFASs measured as sum of targeted PFAS analysis, optionally with prior degradation of precursors (polymeric PFASs excluded from quantification) ≤ 50 mg/kg (50 ppm) for PFASs (polymeric PFASs included). If total fluorine exceeds 50 mg F/kg the manufacturer, importer or downstream user shall upon request provide to the enforcement authorities a proof for the fluorine measured as content of either PFASs or non-PFASs. 	 □ Existing limits ☑ Proposed limits 	Procedure for end-of waste	This class of chemical is currently being assessed for a restriction under REACH (ECHA, 2023c)

DETRITUS - Multidisciplinary Journal for Circular Economy and Sustainable Management of Residues. © 2023 CISA Publisher. All rights reserved



Table S.2. Descriptive statistics of the concentration data gathered for the category "Paper and cardboard waste".

Parameter	n	Median	Range	Q3	90%	95%	
	-		ppb				
PFOA	215	0.918	0.029 - 2356	2.788	8.881	48.800	
C9-C14 PFASs	505	0.610	0.005 - 2111	0.950	5.036	29.650	
PFOS	153	0.610	0.005 - 36.992	3.010	5.019	7.260	
PFHxS	74	0.610	0.005 - 7.45	0.610	0.610	0.610	
Other PFASs	1733	0.610	0.002 - 12700	0.900	7.412	78.160	

Table S.3. Descriptive statistics of the concentration data gathered for the category "Textile and leather
 waste".

Parameter	n	Median	Range	Q3	90%	95%
	-	ppb				
PFOA	101	0.555	0.039 - 57.2	0.875	6.000	12.400
C9-C14 PFASs	343	0.140	0.08 - 530	0.635	0.912	2.834
PFOS	108	0.660	0.01 - 8849	1.408	12.990	143.963
PFHxS	101	0.615	0.027 - 1085	0.870	2.500	5.950
Other PFASs	835	0.620	0.01 - 40900	0.937	7.124	150.000

				J			
Parameter	n	Median	Range	Q3	90%	95%	
	-	ppb					
PFOA	39	0.045	0.045 - 3.46	0.080	0.744	2.380	
C9-C14 PFASs	174	0.090	0.01 - 0.84	0.125	0.140	0.287	
PFOS	46	0.080	0.01 - 35.5	1.698	2.935	4.993	
PFHxS	35	0.055	0.01 - 0.34	0.080	0.086	0.222	
Other PFASs	319	0.080	0.01 - 16.9	0.080	0.410	0.827	

Table S.4. Descriptive statistics of the concentration data gathered for the category "Plastic waste".

Table S.5.	Descriptive	statistics	of the	concentration	data	gathered	for the	category	"Metal	waste	and
metal scra	os".										

Parameter	n	Median	Range	Q3	90%	95%
	-	ppb				
PFOA	5	9.390	1 - 14.03	11.350	12.958	13.494
C9-C14 PFASs	9	0.610	0.12 - 2.7	1.130	2.180	2.440
PFOS	11	4.650	1 - 11.3	9.035	9.190	10.245
PFHxS	3	0.200	0.18 - 0.21	0.205	0.208	0.209
Other PFASs	27	1.090	0.01 - 5065.6	1.535	17.048	52.289